THE CHALLENGES OF DELIVERING A PUBLIC LIBRARY SERVICE USING VOLUNTEERS: A QUALITATIVE INVESTIGATION EXAMINING KEY STAKEHOLDER EXPERIENCES

Dr Biddy Casselden
Northumbria University
b.casselden@northumbria.ac.uk
Co authors - Dr Alison Pickard
Dr Geoff Walton
Emergence of a hybrid public library landscape

In past 6 years complex picture has emerged (Wainwright et al 2016)

343 libraries closed

A quarter of all paid library jobs gone

Recruitment of 15,500 volunteers

Sticking plaster approach to heal cuts
VOLUNTEER BENEFITS

'Volunteers have always contributed to libraries' (Sieghart Independent Library Report for England 2014, p.21)

Additionality/value-added

Enhancing capacity and expertise

Community engagement

Social inclusion

Reciprocal relationship

 Volunteers develop new skills, widen social networks and become empowered

http://www.staffordshirenewsroom.co.uk/hundreds-volunteers-back-libraries/
VOLUNTEER CHALLENGES

- The elephant in the room
- Political
- Random and reactive
- Job replacement
- Barriers to volunteering
- Usual suspects
- Social exclusion
- Coercion reduces benefits
- Lack of capacity
- Costly
MY RESEARCH

Phase 1 Delphi study
Phase 2 Case study investigation
2 North East Metropolitan Boroughs
4 stakeholder groups questioned
Interviews, focus groups, surveys
Themes, triangulation
Rich picture
PHASE 2 FINDINGS

The mismatch of opinions relating to volunteer use in public libraries

CHALLENGING MACRO/MICRO ENVIRONMENT

Volunteer has a positive role
Volunteer as support and source of expertise
Volunteer plays a bridging role
Facilitates community engagement and inclusivity
Generates social capital and service enrichment
Improved quality and accountability
Relational state and localism

Contested themes

Volunteer management and use
Relationships
Control and reward
Professionalism and quality

Volunteer has a negative role
Volunteer plays a divisive and highly sensitive politicised role together with a misunderstanding of the role of the library
Community capacity lacking
Usual suspects dominate in volunteering resulting in an exclusive service
Selfish actions on part of volunteers conflict with service priorities
Hidden costs of volunteer management imply ideological shift from state provision of services
Diminished quality and accountability

Enablers
Communication
Trust
Management styles
Strategy
Value appreciation
Team approach
Partnership working

Barriers
Policy
Community capacity
Ignorance
Tensions
Cultural clash
Fragmented
Largely untested
CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS

Volunteer is a political pawn?
Volunteer management and use
- Challenge of meeting service priorities AND embedding a volunteer in the workforce

Fragile relationships - symbiotic parasitism
- Revere relationships need to consider the balance of power, and blurred boundaries that may exist
- Sense of situation: Lack of respect and support for volunteers, impersonation, feeling safe, treated and valued. Mutually beneficial relationships

Control and reward - consistency and accountability
- Safeguard actions are part of volunteers conflict with service priorities
- Community capacity lacking - volunteers may succeed, volunteers can walk away if they wish

Professionalism and quality
- The usual suspects dominate - professional, middle class, and ex-professional. Danger of social exclusion of other groups
- De-professionalisation of library service, impact on service delivery and quality

Communication as a tool for gaining 'buy in'
- Readable and clear communication in order to facilitate effective communication
- Clear and open communication which seeks to build further the linkages between all stakeholders

Mixed methods of public service delivery

Key issues
- Careful planning of volunteer recruitment, selection and management procedures
- Suitable induction and training. The right to say no to volunteers

Solutions
- New skills for library managers required
- Partnership, rewards, project planning
- Relationship building through trust and respect, teamwork, and shared space. The strengths of the volunteer group
- Importance of communication setting as facilitator. Volunteer relationship management (VROM) used to maintain links between the library and the volunteers
- Different management styles and strategies. Building ownership as we all have a ‘voice in the service’ and see bigger picture. Teambuilding, trust and loyalty. Everybody’s library

Economic austerity
- Urgency, uncertainty, untested
- Misunderstanding of libraries
- Local factors

- Importance of targeted volunteer selection and appropriate training and management. Volunteers need to see bigger picture
- Customer focus should be paramount in everything the Library does, the ABC stakeholders involved. Community focus is part of that equation
- Communicate appreciation. Being one feeling part of a team. Cohesiveness and valuing volunteer efforts. Therefore, less turnover of volunteers
‘The ultimate challenge is one of resources; its financial, it’s the budget situation we are in, because of the situation that the council is in. The budget has been massively hit, we’ve so far managed without closing any libraries though we have reduced hours, we’ve also taken hits in the book fund over recent years, but we are now at a situation where there is nowhere else to go really’ (Library manager interview LA1)

‘In the North-East we know that our local authorities have had the brunt of the cutbacks from the Tory government, and you just think how far can they cut them?’ (Volunteer focus group LA1)

‘That’s the way people think; if it’s not making money it’s not worth its salt’ (Volunteer focus group LA1)
VOLUNTEER MANAGEMENT AND USE

‘It’s become tinged lately, there’s not animosity towards them (volunteers), but there’s definitely a few rumblings amongst staff. The staff are getting more and more work to do front-line, and less and less of the…… nice side’ (Library manager interview LA2)

‘Volunteers are I think……..tricky to handle. It’s more difficult than staff, because after all, as a manager or a supervisor, you can tell somebody to do something who is staff, or NOT to do something, and they either listen to you and do what you say, or they can be in trouble. It’s not quite the same with volunteers’ (Library manager interview LA1)

‘We can walk away for a start if we don’t like it, but they can’t. We can pick or choose, they can’t. If we decide not to come in on a Wednesday or come in on the Thursday instead, we can’ (Volunteer focus group LA1)

'A small volunteer group can take more support, of paid staff’s time, than the rest of the paid staff put together. So does their value outweigh the benefits that they bring?’(Library manager interview LA2)
RELATIONSHIPS

‘I think there could be quite a lot of resistance to new people (volunteers), and staff are resistant to new people. They’re alright with the people you’ve got, but it is quite a delicate balance’ (Library manager interview LA2)

‘The council kind of acts as though it’s willingly giving up its time. It doesn’t want us... well I’m not saying it doesn’t want us to have it (the library), but it wants us to have it, but within its own sound box really. They’ve put up a lot of walls” (Volunteer focus group LA2)

‘They’ve (volunteers) had arguments amongst themselves. I’m now very aware there are probably 3 distinct groups of people, and they come in at separate times, and they’re not communicating with each other even though they are working on the same project. The older group don’t like the newer group of people who have come in’ (Library manager interview LA1)
CONTROL AND REWARD

‘It’s the level of control you can have as well; volunteer staff are volunteering their time, they can come and go as they like. You’ve got no real authority over volunteers, I mean you can put guidelines in place, but you can’t bring to bear some of the pressures you can on paid staff ’ (Library manager interview LA1)

‘You’re here for your own enjoyment, and you’re here voluntarily……..so it is a little bit more relaxed amongst us because of that, so we do operate differently to paid staff’ (Volunteer focus group LA2)

‘I do think the population couldn’t support that (volunteering). I don’t think you would get the body of people to run a library on a consistent basis……..I just don’t think we’ve got enough, for want of a better word, professional people, as a pool to come in to do that’ (Library manager interview LA1)

‘You can’t make them (volunteers) stay, you have to ask nicely. You do have to always be aware that they are not employees, they are members of the public who are helping you, and they can be a law unto themselves’ (Library manager interview LA1)
PROFESSIONALISM AND QUALITY

‘We do have one gentleman, who’s possibly got Alzheimer’s or senility. His volunteering really really helps him, but there’s a point at which it’s quite difficult to find him something to do........ But we know it is really important for him to keep coming along, and to be as involved as possible, so I find that quite a challenge’ (Library manager interview LA1)

‘You might get some very enthusiastic people, but I think it is more than having enthusiastic people, you need someone who understands what a library is’ (Library manager interview LA1)
SOLUTIONS TO THE CHALLENGES

Communication as a lynchpin
Purpose, belonging, ownership, loyalty and trust
The role of space
Customer focus
Mutually beneficial relationships
Formalisation of volunteer management procedures
New skills for managers
Volunteer relationship management
TO CONCLUDE

‘A library in the middle of a community is a cross between an emergency exit, a life raft and a festival. They are cathedrals of the mind; hospitals of the soul; theme parks of the imagination. On a cold, rainy island, they are the only sheltered public spaces where you are not a consumer, but a citizen instead……..

As the cuts kick in, protestors and lawyers are fighting for individual libraries like villagers pushing stranded whales back into the sea. A library is such a potent symbol of a town's values: Each one closed down might as well be 6,000 stickers plastered over every available surface, reading.

‘WE CHOSE TO BECOME MORE STUPID AND DULL!’

Libraries that stayed open during the Blitz will be closed by budgets. A trillion small doors closing’ (Moran, 2013: p.211)