Northumbria Research Link

Citation: Vo, Thuc (2012) Comments on the article: “A new FE model based on higher order zigzag theory for the analysis of laminated sandwich beam with soft core”, by A. Chakrabarti, H. Chalak, M.A. Iqbal, A.H. Sheikh [Composite Structures 93 (2011) 271–279]. Composite Structures, 94 (8). 2666 -2666. ISSN 0263-8223

Published by: Elsevier

URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.compstruct.2012.02.031 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.compstruct.2012.02.031>

This version was downloaded from Northumbria Research Link: http://nrl.northumbria.ac.uk/13364/

Northumbria University has developed Northumbria Research Link (NRL) to enable users to access the University’s research output. Copyright © and moral rights for items on NRL are retained by the individual author(s) and/or other copyright owners. Single copies of full items can be reproduced, displayed or performed, and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided the authors, title and full bibliographic details are given, as well as a hyperlink and/or URL to the original metadata page. The content must not be changed in any way. Full items must not be sold commercially in any format or medium without formal permission of the copyright holder. The full policy is available online: http://nrl.northumbria.ac.uk/policies.html

This document may differ from the final, published version of the research and has been made available online in accordance with publisher policies. To read and/or cite from the published version of the research, please visit the publisher’s website (a subscription may be required.)

www.northumbria.ac.uk/nrl

northumbria UNIVERSITY NEWCASTLE

Letter to the Editor

Comments on the article: ‘‘A new FE model based on higher order zigzag theory for the analysis of laminated sandwich beam with soft core”, by Chakrabarti, A.; Chalak, H.; Iqbal, M. A. and Sheikh, A. H. [Composite Structures 93 (2011) 271–279].

Thuc P. Vo[*a,b]

[a]School of Engineering, Glyndwr University, Mold Road, Wrexham LL11 2AW, UK.

[b]Advanced Composite Training and Development Centre, Glyndwr University,
Unit 5, Hawarden Industrial Park, Deeside, Flintshire CH5 3US, UK.

In this letter, two refined shear deformation beam models [1], the higher-order beam theory (HOBT) and the sinusoidal shear beam theory (SSBT), are used to compare with the results of the higher-order zigzag theory (HOZT) by Chakrabarti et al. [2]. For verification purpose, symmetric cross-ply composite beams, symmetric and anti-symmetric sandwich beams are anlysed. The material properties and non-dimentional displacements can be found in Ref. [2]. Through the close correlation observed between the present model and the earlier works [3-5] in Tables 1 and 2, accuracy of the present model is established. It may be observed that the results from HOZT are always larger than HOBT and SSBT especially for lower span-to-height ratio.

Table 1: Non-dimensional mid-span displacements of a symmetric cross-ply $[0^0/90^0/0^0]$ composite beam under a uniformly distributed load with cantilever and simply-supported boundary conditions.

Theory	Reference	L/h			
		5	10	20	50
a. Cantilever beam					
HOBT	Khdeir and Reddy [3]	6.824	3.455	-	2.251
	Murthy et al. [4]	6.836	3.466	-	2.262
	Present	6.830	3.461	2.530	2.257
SSBT	Present	6.842	3.478	2.536	2.258
HOZT	Chakrabarti et al. [2]	7.489	3.660	-	2.275

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +44 1978 293979.

E-mail address: t.vo@glyndwr.ac.uk (Thuc P. Vo).

b. Simply-supported beam					
HOBT	Khdeir and Reddy [3]	2.412	1.096	-	0.665
	Murthy et al. [4]	2.398	1.090	-	0.661
	Aguiar et al. [5]	2.426	1.105	0.762	0.665
	Present	2.414	1.098	0.761	0.666
SSBT	Present	2.444	1.108	0.764	0.667
HOZT	Chakrabarti et al. [2]	2.614	1.170	-	0.667

Table 2: Non-dimensional mid-span displacements of a simply-supported anti-symmetric sandwich [1/2/3/1/3] beam under a uniformly distributed load.

Theory	Reference	L/h			
		10	20	50	100
HOBT	Present	1.1093	0.8544	0.7828	0.7726
SSBT	Present	1.1155	0.8560	0.7831	0.7726
HOZT	Chakrabarti et al. [2]	1.1364	0.8643	-	0.7749
3D Elasticity	Pagano	1.2151	0.8874	-	0.7785

It seems that the results in Table 3 of Chakrabarti et al. [2] are not correct and need modifications. For this symmetric lay-up $[0^0/90^0/C/90^0/0^0]$, all coupling effects from material vanish. Thus, the axial displacement u can not be obtained. Besides, the results are quite small especially for lower span-to-height ratio.

Table 3: Non-dimensional mid-span displacements of a simply-supported symmetric sandwich $[0^0/90^0/C/90^0/0^0]$ beam under a uniformly distributed load.

Theory	Reference	L/h				
		5	10	20	50	100
HOBT	Present	9.4743	3.7328	2.2338	1.8095	1.7487
SSBT	Present	9.3801	3.7235	2.2324	1.8093	1.7487
HOZT	Chakrabarti et al. [1]	7.9568	3.3060	2.1380	1.8112	1.7640

Reference

1. Vo T. P. and Thai T-H. Static behaviour of composite beams using various refined shear deformation theories. *Composite Structures* 2012, to appear.

2. Chakrabarti, A.; Chalak, H.; Iqbal, M. A. and Sheikh, A. H. A new FE model based on higher order zigzag theory for the analysis of laminated sandwich beam with soft core, *Composite Structures* 93 (2011) 271-279.

3. Khdeir, A. A. and Reddy, J. N. An exact solution for the bending of thin and thick cross-ply laminated beams, *Composite Structures,* 1997, *37,* 195-203

4. Murthy, M. V. V. S.; Mahapatra, D. R.; Badarinarayana, K. and Gopalakrishnan, S. A refined higher order finite element for asymmetric composite beams *Composite Structures,* 2005*, 67,* 27 - 35

5. Aguiar, R. M.; Moleiro, F. and Soares, C. M. M. Assessment of mixed and displacement-based models for static analysis of composite beams of different cross-sections, *Composite Structures,* 2012, *94,* 601 – 616.