

## Chapter 1

### **Policing the Global South-- colonial legacies, pluralities, partnerships and reform**

*Danielle Watson, Queensland University of Technology, [orcid.org/0000-0001-5094-5545](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5094-5545)*

*Sara N. Amin, The University of the South Pacific, [orcid.org/0000-0002-2231-3505](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2231-3505)*

*Wendell C. Wallace, The University of the West Indies, St. Augustine, [orcid.org/0000-0002-5164-5103](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5164-5103)*

*Oluwagbenga Michael Akinlabi, Northumbria University, [orcid.org/0000-0002-0070-2673](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0070-2673)*

*Juan Carlos Ruiz-Vasquez, Universidad del Rosario in Bogotá, [orcid.org/0000-0001-9130-6950](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9130-6950)*

**Abstract:** An increase in intellectual knowledge produced by scholars from the Global South about policing issues not aligned to northern ideological positions and specific to non-northern context represent a conscious shift away from the acceptance of a northern monopoly over policing scholarship. *Policing the Global South* purposefully present criminological scholarship from scholars in the Global South responding to issues within policing contexts in post-colonial developing countries across the globe. It facilitates an examination of the multidimensional nature of policing in the Global South, its relationship with historical, social and ideological factors, as well as the acknowledgement of complexities engendered through various contextual realities. This chapter introduces the aim and overview of the volume and its organization through five themes: Acknowledging colonial legacies and their impact on policing; Navigating plural regulatory systems and policing partnerships; Access to justice, community perceptions and police legitimacy; Organisational reform, crime prevention and community partnerships; and the expanding roles of police organisations.

**Keywords:** policing; global south; colonial legacies; plural policing; policing partnerships; police reform.

Knowledge production and intellectual rhetoric the English-speaking Global North account for most of the policing scholarship produced and disseminated globally. Scholarly perspectives from the Northern knowledge centre have therefore shaped intellectual perspectives that largely exclude most of the world's population relegated to northern margins (Carrington, Hogg, Scott, Sozzo & Walters, 2018; Watson & Kerrigan, 2018). An increase in intellectual knowledge produced by scholars from the Global South about policing issues not aligned to northern ideological positions and specific to non-northern context represent a conscious shift away from the acceptance of a northern monopoly over policing scholarship. *Policing the Global South* purposefully present criminological scholarship from scholars in the Global South responding to issues within policing contexts in post-colonial developing countries across the globe. It facilitates an examination of the multidimensional nature of policing in the Global South, its relationship with historical, social and ideological factors, as well as the acknowledgement of complexities engendered through various contextual realities (Carrington, Hogg, Scott & Sozzo, 2018). The book contextualises policing and how it is practiced, interpreted, and evaluated from a South-to-South perspective.

The volume contributes to the Southern criminological agenda by advancing the transnationalisation and democratisation of ideas about policing practices and philosophies. It highlights recent advancements in policing studies and introduces novel perspectives into the field of policing from scholars on the 'periphery'. The authors examine how policing issues that are not aligned with northern ideological positions and are unique to non-northern contexts are addressed using a post-colonial lens and empirical knowledge from country-specific cases in Africa, Asia, the Caribbean, the Pacific, and Latin America. Additionally, the volume discusses Southern responses to crime and criminality and how policing in the Global South is adapted to address contextual challenges arising from the South's historical, social, ideological, and contextual realities (which are often different from those in the North).

## **Structure of the Book**

Drawing on country-specific cases from countries impacted by colonialism in the Global South, the chapters in the volume explore policing and its colonial legacies, the existence of multiple actors in the policing space, contextual responses to police service provision, the expanding role of police organisations, the changing face of crime and criminality, and the tensions which impact police/community relations. The chapters are organised around these five sub-themes that are critical for understanding policing in the Global South. While we recognise that our sub-themes do not cover all aspects of policing in the Global South, we believe they are necessary to capture the shared realities of state organisations operating in diverse jurisdictions worldwide and to provide contextualised South-on-South accounts of how policing is practised, interpreted, and assessed. The following is a summary of the chapter contributions organised by sub-themes: Acknowledging colonial legacies and their impact on policing; Navigating plural regulatory systems and policing partnerships; Access to justice, community perceptions and police legitimacy; Organisational reform, crime prevention and community partnerships; and the expanding roles of police organisations.

**Part 1 – Acknowledging colonial legacies and their impact on policing:** The origins of policing in the Global South are inextricably linked to the establishment of imperially imposed political institutions and legacies of conflict, insurrection, violence and all other facets of colonial administration. In keeping with its colonial origins, policing organisations serve the primary purpose of law-and-order maintenance, which provides a justification for actions deemed to be in the service of maintaining order and responding to threats against the state. The chapters in this section acknowledge the impact of colonial legacies on policing in former colonies, both past and present. They emphasise the importance of not only acknowledging but also deconstructing these legacies in order to comprehend the connections between past and

present, with the goal of charting a contextualised and actionable course for policing in the Global South.

*Markus-Michael Müller* examines state-sanctioned violence against members of Latin America's marginalised groups. He draws parallels between colonial and contemporary policing practises in order to demonstrate the persistence of imperial legacies under the guise of modern policing practises. By highlighting the persistence of stratification, marginalisation, and othering in Latin American societies, he demonstrates the imperial imprint on police organisations in their capacity as state control apparatus.

*Annabelle Dias Felix and María Teresa Martínez Trujillo* discuss how the continued use of colonial lenses impairs judicial logic and completely undermines efforts toward positive police reform. They demonstrate the methodological and theoretical flaws inherent in uncontextualized evaluation systems informed by colonial ideologies. Additionally, arguments are made to demonstrate how reform efforts continue to benefit a privileged few while ostensibly serving the larger populace, the majority of whom remain marginalised and overpoliced.

*Michael Jerome Wolff* examines the relationship between Brazil's postcolonial legacy and contemporary policing through the lens of two diametrically opposed approaches: "hard" military intervention and "soft" human rights defence. The author evaluates policing strategies such as Pacifying Police Units (UPPs, their Portuguese acronym) and Pacto pela Vida, highlighting their successes and failures. He explains the necessity of providing security to the upper classes during the Portuguese empire through the establishment of both military and civilian police institutions, as well as the introduction of a new convenient legal system, through an engaging and well-documented historical account of the colonial era. According to the author, the police were critical in preserving political order and containing social groups

such as labour unions and so-called dangerous classes. Wolff asserts that, while there was influence from the North, there was also a distinct Brazilian policing model, which explains the contemporary evolution of "militarization" of police and security issues through the creation of new units such as the Battalion of Special Operations (BOPE in Portuguese) and the evolution of UPPs from initial success to decline.

*Zoha Waseem* provides a close analysis of how the colonial legacy of the police institution in Pakistan continues through the 'VIP' culture in how Karachi police services are directed towards political and economic elites. Waseem shows how this further reinforces both the exclusion of marginalised communities in Karachi and encourages political corruption. Such a VIP culture also privatizes and co-opts the public police for the service of urban security for the elite. Waseem argues this dynamic is not the same as power dynamics and relations between police and upper classes in the global north. In the post-colonial context of Karachi, Pakistan, Waseem suggests that 'By patronising police officers to serve the elite and simultaneously ensuring that police officers remain suppressed (through the lack of investments and financial support provided to the police, as shown ahead, as well as through discipline and control measures), the postcolonial state continues to deliver a policing system as envisioned by its colonial predecessor.

*Juan Carlos Ruiz-Vásquez* provides insight into police reform in Colombia, which he describes as being threatened by extraordinarily powerful criminal organisations. He described a country, and more broadly, a region, where there is widespread distrust of the police and a high degree of politicisation of law enforcement organisations. The chapter debates the 'positive and significant evolution' of Colombia's armed forces. Additionally, an overview of the transformative processes that Ruiz-Vásquez attributes to the successful transformation of Colombia's police force is provided.

**Part 2 – Navigating plural regulatory systems and policing partnerships:** For former colonies throughout the Global South, state police are a colonial import designed to aid in the maintenance of implanted systems of governance and the rule of colonial acknowledged power stakeholders. In many of these instances, systems of governance, or more precisely, law and order maintenance arrangements, existed prior to establishment of state-sponsored police organisations. At the community, tribe, clan, or other social grouping level, some of these arrangements were legitimate. To date, the legitimacy of non-state stakeholders has been maintained in a variety of contexts, with some even receiving state recognition. Along with pre-colonial arrangements for maintaining social order and state-established police organisations, there has been a noticeable increase in the privatisation of security services and a significant increase in the number of recognised service providers and stakeholders in the law-and-order maintenance space. While the existence of multiple regulatory systems in some contexts reflects the continuation of previous policing arrangements alongside state-sanctioned organisations, in others, the policing, or more precisely, the security arrangements, that exist, are in response to market demand for increased private security services. Globalisation has also resulted in increased collaboration between national, regional, and international law enforcement agencies to provide more comprehensive responses to law-and-order maintenance needs. The chapters in this section recognise the state police's inability to serve as the sole agency responsible for maintaining law and order. Additionally, they shed light on how plural policing arrangements are negotiated in various parts of the Global South.

*Sara N. Amin, Tanya Trussler, Danielle Watson, and Sepola Taata Niulakita* assess stakeholder perspectives on religion's evolving role and its impact on policing practises. This Chapter, appropriately titled 'Serving God, the Community, and the State: Policing in Tuvalu,' reflects the multiplicity of factors affecting contemporary policing practises. Additionally, the authors of this Chapter illuminate the policing/religion/customs nexus in a non-Western context by

using Tuvalu to demonstrate how the police can use religion and traditional authorities to maintain law and order in the modern era. Amin and colleagues' findings underscore the importance of recalibrating our worldview regarding police officer training in postcolonial societies where state authority and legitimacy intersect in time and space but are predicated on the continued cooperation and consent of customary and religious authorities.

*Logan Puck* analyses the private security sector in Mexico, demonstrating the effects of state intervention through direct regulation and intervention. This chapter makes a seminal contribution to the field of private security, which is a large and growing sector in Latin America, but surprisingly lacks an extensive scholarly literature on the subject. Puck establishes a historical, criminal, and economic context for the growth of the private security industry. Private surveillance prevailed from the nineteenth century to the late 1980s, providing security for merchants and residents. Beginning in the late 1980s, there will be a greater emphasis on regulating this sector. The author demonstrates the informality of a significant portion of this sector and the government's inability to exercise effective control because of resource constraints and corruption. Nowadays, private security is the most common method by which citizens of the region obtain security in the face of weak or non-existent states. It continues to be a highly informal sector devoid of training and social protection for its workers.

*Julie Berg and Guy Lamb* provide insight into South African society's inclusive security provision. The chapter discusses plural policing in times of crisis by examining the policing of crime and violence in a complex, unequal society that presents significant challenges to policing, safety, and security. Berg and Lamb examine the impact of crises on the development and erosion of plural policing plans and arrangements, highlighting the disjunction between the normative ideals of achieving 'peaceful and inclusive societies' as defined by SDG 16 and the realities of plural policing in the Global South.

*Cassandra Harry, Danielle Watson, and Gordon Nanau* engage in contemporary discourse on pluralised policing by garnering the thoughts of police officers in the Solomon Island and presenting the police officers' experiences of plural policing in the jurisdiction of the Solomon Islands. They discuss the current environment of policing, with heavy emphasis on knowledge creation and transference of scholarship on policing from all areas of the globe. They authors argue that police perspectives on policing is just as important as public perspectives on policing. Additionally, they discuss how over the last two decades, policing has become increasingly pluralised and broader in scope as there is now a rise of newer providers of policing, in addition to state and federal policing. Generally, newer forms of policing focus on the policing and control of petty crime and disorder in public places and the providers can be both public and private organisations. In light of the global increase in plural policing, international scholarship is needed to understand the phenomenon of plural policing and its meaning to the state security apparatus.

**Part 3 – Access to justice, community perceptions and police legitimacy:** International organisations such as the United Nations have identified access to justice as a fundamental human right. Many individuals worldwide lack equal access to justice and are unable to benefit from the justice systems in an adequate manner. Police are widely recognised as the primary state-appointed frontline responders in a variety of contexts worldwide. Additionally, police are the primary actors in the process of maintaining and enforcing law and order as defined by each country's legislation. As a result, they are critical to the proper functioning of a country's justice system. Access to justice issues frequently shape community perceptions of police as law enforcers, which in turn shapes views on police legitimacy. Several policing scholars have examined the relationship between access to justice and perceptions of police legitimacy. The chapters in this section emphasise not only how police perceptions affect relationships with the communities they serve, but also how police institutions can aid or obstruct individuals seeking



access to justice, particularly the most vulnerable members of society or members of marginalised groups.

*Tumpa Mukherjee* in her chapter on women police stations in West Bengal (India) and *Sadaf Ahmad* in their chapter on women police stations in seven cities in Pakistan allow us to understand how women in communities are being served by police, as well as the challenges that women police stations face in providing policing services. These two chapters provide important counterpoints to discussions of women and police in the Global North, as well as underscoring the need to contextualize ‘Global South’ solutions, including regional and national solutions. These two chapters provide a deeper understanding of paying attention to how gender relations are placed in the community and in relation to other ethnic, political and sectarian dynamics, as well as how gender is structured in the police organizations specifically. These chapters highlight the need to look comparatively at national levels of different approaches and experiences of both trying to serve women in communities and the experience of women in police.

*Tariro Mutongwizo and Nyasha Mutongwizo* examine encounters between citizens and state police, focusing on how these encounters shape daily routines and practises aimed at securing and maintaining social order. The authors examine the state of plural policing in the Global South, with a particular emphasis on Zimbabwe, and the role of police legitimacy in the development of plural mechanisms among underprivileged communities. The chapter demonstrates the plurality of positions held by residents of Mbare (a community in Harare) and staff of two non-governmental organisations in Harare when describing their encounters with the state police. The chapter concludes that while policing structures exist, trust and confidence in police are low, and this has resulted in a plethora of alternative policing mechanisms such as self-policing and vigilantism.

*Moses Agaawena Amagnya* argues in his chapter that most of the common-law countries, particularly those in the Global South, rely heavily on police-led prosecution of criminal cases. Despite its widespread use, the author argues that there are concerns that police-led prosecutions may result in injustice. The author argues further that, police prosecutions frequently involve the majority of criminal cases processed by criminal justice systems (CJS), which disproportionately affect vulnerable individuals who cannot afford justice. Equally, police prosecutors wield enormous discretionary authority, particularly during the pre-trial stage, which frequently lacks clear and specific guidelines governing how discretionary authority is exercised and victims are treated. Furthermore, the exercise of discretionary powers by police prosecutors during the pre-trial stage is largely impervious to review. Finally, police prosecutors are typically not required by law to justify their decisions or to publicly state the principles upon which they exercise discretionary authority. In light of these challenges, Amagnya examines police prosecution practices in Ghana using qualitative data. His analysis revealed that police prosecutors place a low premium on the critical role of pre-trial conferencing with complainants, witnesses, and accused individuals. And that police prosecution in Ghana faces significant obstacles, including a lack of uniformity and clarity in pre-trial procedures, insufficient training and professional development, and lawyers verbally abusing prosecutors. The chapter concludes with a discussion of the findings' implications for police prosecution and administration of justice.

*Oluwagbenga Michael Akinlabi* presents an investigation into Nigerians' satisfaction with the police. He emphasises the importance of police organisations collaborating with the larger populace in order to be successful in their efforts to maintain social order. There are critical arguments made about the interconnections between police legitimacy, procedural justice, and public perceptions of police and policing. Akinlabi also suggests the need for additional research on satisfaction with police in the Global South, emphasising the importance of

considering context-specific variables and gaining a better understanding of how community perceptions, policing outcomes, and procedural justice affect policing in various contexts.

**Part 4 – Organisational reform, crime prevention and community partnerships:** Attempts by police organisations across the globe to disassociate from their colonial paramilitaristic roots have accelerated shifts towards conceptualisations of policing as a primarily service-oriented task done in collaboration with the state and population to collectively maintain law and order. Much of the policing literature in the 21<sup>st</sup> century draw attention to either the need for organisational reform or attempts at restructuring and improving policing. There has also been significant emphasis placed on the crime prevention dimensions of policing and the criticality of police partnering with the communities to maximise service delivery. The chapters in this section draw attention to issues associated with organisational transformations across varied parts of the Global South. The authors highlight the need for organisational transformations while also discussing how attempts at transformation are marred with different contextual variables. They further draw attention to issues related to the importation and adoption of external solutions to address local problems, while also proposing alternative context-specific solutions to local problems.

*Muhammad Abbas, Raymond Shuey and Vandra Harris* examine efforts at employing community policing by the Pakistani police forces in Islamabad. The chapter provides an in-depth examination of the efforts of the Islamabad police to change police-community relationship from one of fear to cooperation. The authors show that the fear and lack of trust dynamics are due to historically politicized relationship between the public and authority in Pakistan. Abbas, Shuey and Harris find that community policing efforts to build trust have been effective through increasing competence of both police and community. The authors highlight both how these gaps are due to the colonial legacy of authoritarian policing, as well as how efforts are being made to change policing through fear to policing with cooperation in

the community. The authors also highlight that community policing models need to be contextualized and adapted to take into account existing social inequities and other public institution dynamics which shape the ability to change the relationship between police and community in Pakistan.

*Chris Emzin, John Scott and Zoe Staines* provide insight into the realities of indigenous police officers in the Torres Strait region of Australia. Scholarly arguments about the Torres Strait as belonging to the group of Pacific islands described as Melanesia and bearing more commonalities with small island developing states in the Pacific region than conforming to constructions of Australia as a power developed nation are indicative of remnants of the colonial past. The authors of this chapter demonstrate the importance of acknowledging and examining indigeneity as critical to the policing of indigenous communities in settler societies. They draw attention to the need for a connection to aid police relations with indigenous communities and provide insight into the realities of such an arrangement in the Torres Strait region.

*Niloy Ranjan Biswas* provides an important analysis on the use of community policing in Bangladesh to counter violent extremism. The chapter shows that community policing has had robust support from both police and community. However, efforts at community policing have also been hindered by under-resourcing and that implementation has been experimental and haphazard. The chapter provides a clear example of how the effectiveness of community policing efforts depends on the ability of police and community policing structures and practices taking into account local-level politics, including sectarian and class divisions. In particular, Biswas notes that many aspects of community policing to counter violent extremism remains top-down instead of developing a partnership approach and that ethnic and religious minority groups need to be included in these efforts. Moreover, Biswas also points to how the

lack of integration of community policing approaches with other (state) security agencies continues to hamper efforts at countering violent extremism.

*Wendell C. Wallace* draws evidence from a case study conducted in the twin island republic of Trinidad and Tobago to highlight the practicality of crime prevention through social development. He provides insight into the workings of an indigenous crime prevention through social development approach that was implemented to address issues of crime and deviance in a marginalised and highly stigmatised community. While the author points to the relevance and feasibility of implementing locally conceptualised crime prevention programmes as a well-suited strategy to aid in crime prevention and decreased victimisation, he is careful to explain the successes of such an initiative as dependent on stakeholder partnerships at the community level and to clarify that such initiatives should not be viewed as stand-alone alternatives to reduce crime.

*Anand Chand, Pariniappa Goundar and Maureen Karan* present compelling arguments about the (in)effectiveness of imported community policing models in Fiji. The chapter, which makes a much need contribution to the limited body of policing literature on policing in Pacific island countries, provide a critical examination of five imported community policing schemes implemented in Fiji and present their views on the contextual applicability or lack thereof of each. The authors further suggest the need for the development of indigenous self-policing initiatives informed by knowledge of context and cognisant of local needs as opposed to further imported models, which they describe as having had very little success in Fiji.

*Peter K. B. St. Jean* examines community policing in the Caribbean by using the island of Dominica as the proxy for his research. This chapter provides a systematic overview of the evolution of community policing in the Caribbean as St. Jean situates community policing within the criminal justice system (CJS) landscape in Dominica, where attempts to implement

community policing as an effective strategy to reduce crime and improve the quality of life for residents have been ongoing for the past 24 years, apparently without much success. Instructively, this Chapter does not only highlight challenges to the implementation of community policing initiatives in Dominica's jurisdiction, but also proffer suggestions on approaches to overcome the obstacles associated with implementing community policing on the island in an effort to positively influence crime reduction and peace development realities in Dominica.

**Part 5 – The expanding roles of police organisations:** Police organisations account for a key part of the justice system with a primary responsibility to maintain law and order. The law-and-order maintenance mandate is multifarious and complex, thus accounting for a continued need to review and sometimes revise policing powers, functions, roles and responsibilities. In contexts where assistance is required and there is uncertainty about the best suited responders, police are usually approached. Police organisations as the most ubiquitous arm of governance continue to undergo changes influenced by a series of factors which may include but are not limited to globalisation, political climate, real and perceived threats to security, and cultural, social and economic conditions. As the context within which these organisations exist changes, they too adapt to maintain currency, ensure relevance and meet expanding stakeholder expectations and demands. The chapters in this section discuss some aspects of policing beyond day-to-day responses to issues within communities or issues related to the maintenance of civil law and order commonly referred to as indicative of the conventional policing mandate.

*Suwastika Naidu, Arvind Patel and Atishwar Pandaram* explore the policing of human trafficking and commercial sex in the small-island developing Pacific nation of Kiribati. They draw attention to the limits placed on policing organisations because of inadequate or lacking legislation to inform policing policies, standard operational procedures and overall mandate. The Kiribati case study is used to highlight policing improvisations in the absence of

established guiding legislative frameworks. The authors further present arguments about the increase in organised and transnational crimes in Kiribati underpinned by a southern criminological framework, while also highlighting how police organisations adapt to meet the demands of their expanding roles.

*Wendell C. Wallace* and *Leonary Johnny* provide insights into Caribbean police officers perspectives on the use of technology. They comment on the impact of the introduction of new technologies to policing in their region and provide much needed insight into the prevalence and utility of technology among police departments in the Caribbean. Their findings suggest significant advantages can be derived from the appropriate introduction of technological advancements to policing, while also cautioning about the need to consider technological characters along with other features of the larger environmental context. Their findings also reveal a need for greater research on the topic of technological advancements and their impact on policing the Caribbean.

*Greg Warchol* examines the historical development of European conservation models in Africa and their impact on the establishment of specialised wildlife ranger forces in Sub-Saharan Africa. The chapter focuses on the development of game reserves during European colonial rule of East and Southern Africa, as well as the ranger units established to enforce the new game laws. The author emphasised the long-term consequences for rural indigenous populations. These changes upended Africans' long-established use of land and wildlife resources, as well as the political power dynamics within tribal communities. Additionally, the evolving structure, functions, and perceptions of ranger units are examined, as well as the trend toward militarization and its impact on indigenous Africans who live adjacent to game reserves.

*Sustarum Thammaboosadee* discusses how neocolonialism and neoliberalism have shaped policing of the poor in Thailand and how this has expanded in the context of COVID19. The

chapter provides the historical context on how policing in Thailand is structured around the coloniality of power and produces state-citizen relationships that mimic colonial relations, despite Thailand having not been colonized formally. In the context of the COVID19 pandemic, the chapter highlights how the poor and the precarious have become increasingly policed in Thailand through social welfare policies that criminalize any 'undeserving' person accessing the pandemic-related social benefits. In this process, both police and the poor have to navigate a complex bureaucratic technology of power.

We conclude the volume with our thoughts and analysis about the south-on-south approach we took to aid in understanding policing. Traditional, contemporary, and essential topics pertinent to an understanding of policing beyond the Global North are highlighted. Our conclusion further discusses how the chapters in this volume provide conceptualisations of policing relevant to larger understandings of the complexity, multidimensionality, and ubiquitousness of policing organisations across the globe. Despite similarities in the overarching mandate of police organisations across the globe, we provide our views on how the arguments presented in this volume draw attention to the importance of context in determining the multifarious inventory of policing roles, functions, and duties.

## **References**

- Carrington, K., Hogg, R., Scott, J., Sozzo, M., & Walters, R. (2018). *Southern criminology*. Routledge.
- Carrington, K., Hogg, R., Scott, J., & Sozzo, M. (Eds.). (2018). *The Palgrave handbook of criminology and the global south*. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Devroe, E., & Terpstra, J. (2015). Plural Policing in Western Europe: A Comparison. *European Journal of Policing Studies*, 2(3), 235-244.
- Watson, D., & Kerrigan, D. (2018). Crime, criminality, and north-to-south criminological complexities: Theoretical implications for policing 'hotspot' communities in 'underdeveloped' countries. In *The Palgrave handbook of criminology and the global south* (pp. 611-632). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.